Paradigm Academic Press
Research and Advances in Education
ISSN 2788-7057
FEB. 2023 VOL.2, NO.2

Inequities in the Number of Days Assigned to an Exclusionary Discipline Consequence by the Ethnicity/Race of Texas High School Girls: A Statewide, Multiyear Investigation

Bart J. Miller[1] & John R. Slate[1]

[1] Sam Houston State University

Correspondence: John R. Slate, Sam Houston State University.

doi:10.56397/RAE.2023.02.09

Abstract

Ascertained in this analysis was the extent to which inequities existed in the number of days that Texas Grade 9, 10, and 11 students were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence (i.e., in-school suspension, out-of-school suspension) by the ethnicity/race for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018 school years. Inferential statistical procedures revealed the presence of statistically significant disparities in all three school years and at all three grade levels. At every grade level and school year, Black girls were assigned to more days in an in-school suspension than were Hispanic girls and White girls. For out-of-school suspensions across all three school years, Black girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension statistically significantly more days than Hispanic girls and White girls, and Hispanic girls were assigned statistically significantly more days than White girls with the exception of Grade 10 in 2016-2017, and Grade 11 in 2016-2017 and 2017-2018.

Keywords: in-school suspension, out-of-school suspension, ethnicity/race, Texas, high school, Black, Hispanic, White, girls

1. Introduction

Inequities by ethnicity/race in exclusionary discipline does not just affect boys. Disproportionalities in exclusionary discipline are evident at the national level (Office of Civil Rights, 2016) and state levels (Annamma et al., 2016; Barnes, Slate, Moore & Martinez-Garcia, 2017; Blake, Keith, Luo, Le & Salter, 2017; Morris & Perry, 2017; Slate, Gray & Jones, 2016) for girls as well as boys. Patterns of inequities in exclusionary discipline as it pertains to girls' mirror that of boys and is cause for concern.

According to the Office of Civil Rights (2016), 24,518,548 girls were enrolled in public education in the United States for the 2015-2016 school year. Of that total, 846,502 were assigned one or more days of in-school suspension. For the same year, 2,581,194 girls were enrolled in the State of Texas public schools. Of that total, 197,597 were assigned one or more days of in-school suspension. The most common form of exclusionary discipline consequence for public schools is in-school suspension followed by out-of-school suspensions (Office of Civil Rights, 2016). With respect to the ethnicity/race of girls in the United States who were assigned to an in-school suspension for the 2015-2016 school year, Black girls totaled almost 38% of all girls assigned to an in-school suspension yet they were less than 8% of the total student enrollment population. Hispanic girls represented over 23% of all girls assigned to an in-school suspension and were slightly less than 13% of the total enrollment of students in the United States. White girls were over 33% of all girls assigned an in-school suspension for the 2015-2016 school year and represented over 23% of the total enrollment of all students in the United States.

For the State of Texas, Black girls constituted almost 26% of all girls assigned to an in-school suspension even though they were 6% of girls enrolled in Texas public schools in 2015-2016. Hispanic girls who were assigned

an in-school suspension represented over 52% of all girls assigned to an in-school suspension in Texas and totaled over 25% of all girls enrolled in Texas public schools. White girls were assigned over 18% of all in-school suspensions in Texas and represented less than 14% of all girls enrolled in Texas public schools in 2015-2016 (Office of Civil Rights, 2016). Similar patterns emerge when analyzing the second most commonly used exclusionary discipline consequence of out-of-school suspension. By examining the disparity of assignments to out-of-school suspensions by ethnicity/race of girls in the United States in the 2015-2016 school year, 41% of girls assigned to one or more out-of-school suspension were Black, less than 21% of girls assigned to one or more out-of-school suspensions were Hispanic, and less than 32% of girls who were assigned an out-of-school suspension were White. For the State of Texas, almost 33% of all girls assigned to an out-of-school suspension were Black, over 49% of girls were Hispanic, and less than 19% were White (Office of Civil Rights, 2016). These disproportionalities of exclusionary discipline have also been analyzed nationally in other studies and also in other states.

Using Critical Race Theory and Critical Race Feminism as a guiding theoretical framework, Annamma et al. (2016) analyzed the overrepresentation in exclusionary discipline assignments of Black girls in the Denver Public Schools. The sample in the Annamma et al. (2019) study included over 3,000 Grades K to 12 girls who were assigned a discipline referral in the 2011-2012 school year. Of those girls assigned to a discipline consequence, the makeup of the three largest ethnic/racial groups was 29% Black girls, 57% Hispanic girls, and 9% White girls. The composition of the three largest ethnicity/racial groups of girls in the Denver Public Schools district was 15% Black girls, 58% Hispanic girls, and 20% White girls. Black girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension 52% of the time they were sent to the office. This rate was higher than the rate for Hispanic boys and White boys. Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension 41% of the time they were referred to the office whereas White girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension 31% of the time.

For law enforcement referrals, Black girls and White girls were equally represented at 5% each, however, when the result of the law enforcement referral resulted in expulsions, almost 1% of Black girls were assigned this disciplinary assignment compared to no White girls. When Black girls were sent to the office for the same discipline referrals as Hispanic and White girls, Black girls were punished more severely. Most of the reasons for exclusionary discipline for Black girls were for subjective reasons such as defiance of authority or disrespect whereas for White girls, the reasons were concrete ones such as drug or alcohol possession (Annamma et al., 2016). This overrepresentation of Black girls has also been documented in other states as well.

Examining data from a large urban school district in Kentucky, Morris and Perry (2017) analyzed a sample of 30,202 Grade 6 to Grade 12 students. Morris and Perry (2017) analyzed discipline data over a 4-year period starting in August 2007 to June 2011. Of this total, 49% were girls. The ethnic/racial make-up of this sample was 64% White, 24% Black, and 8% Hispanic. Black boys were over two times more likely to receive discipline referrals for minor to moderate discipline infractions such as disrespect, misuse of cell phones, and being tardy. Black girls were over three times more likely than White girls to receive a discipline referral for the same infractions. Black girls were actually assigned more referrals for minor to moderate infractions than were either White boys or Hispanic boys. Overall, for minor to severe discipline infractions, Black girls had the same probability of being assigned to a discipline referral as were White boys. Similar to the study conducted by Annamma et al. (2016), Morris and Perry (2017) established that Black girls were overrepresented for minor discipline infractions, and more equally represented for severe infractions such as fighting, bullying, truancy, or possession of a weapon.

In Texas, the state of interest for this article, research studies have been conducted on inequities in exclusionary discipline consequences based on gender and ethnicity/race. For the 2013-2014, 2014-2015, and 2015-2016 school years, Barnes et al. (2017) analyzed in-school suspensions and out-of-school suspensions to determine whether inequalities in discipline consequences were present as a function of student ethnicity/race and gender for Grades 6, 7, and 8 students. For Grade 6, 7, and 8 girls and for the 2013-2014, 2014-2015, and 2015-2016 school years, the same patterns emerged. Black girls were assigned to an in-school suspension and to an out-of-school suspension at statistically significantly higher rates than both White and Hispanic girls. Moreover, Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension and to an out-of-school suspension at statistically significant higher rates than White girls.

In another Texas statewide study, White and Slate (2018) examined the degree to which the number of days assigned to an out-of-school suspension was connected with the ethnicity/race of Grade 9 and 10 Texas high school students for the 2013-2014 school year. White and Slate (2018) documented that Grade 9 and 10 Black girls were especially overrepresented in being assigned to an out-of-school suspension whereas Grade 9 and 10 White girls were underrepresented in assignment to an out-of-school suspension, and Grade 9 Hispanic girls were slightly underrepresented as were Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Important to note in their investigation was that Grade 9 Black girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension over six times as often as Grade 9 White girls,

and Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension over three times as often as Grade 9 White girls. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension over 10 times as often as Grade 10 White girls and over two and half times more often than Grade 10 Hispanic girls.

In another Texas statewide study, White (2019) analyzed whether inequities were also present in the number of days assigned to an in-school suspension and to an out-of-school suspension for middle school girls for the 2012-2013 school year through the 2015-2016 school year. For the four school years, Grade 6 Black girls were assigned on average 0.93 days more to an in-school suspension assignment than were Grade 6 White girls. Grade 6 Hispanic girls were assigned an average of 0.39 days more for an in-school suspension than did Grade 6 White girls. Grade 7 Black girls were assigned on average 0.89 days more to an in-school suspension than were Grade 7 White girls from 2012-2016. Grade 7 Hispanic girls were assigned on average 0.36 days more in an in-school suspension than were Grade 7 White girls. Grade 8 Black girls were assigned an average 0.62 days more to an in-school suspension assignment than were Grade 8 White girls. Grade 8 Hispanic girls were assigned 0.15 days more to an in-school suspension than were Grade 8 White girls for the four years examined in the study.

For assignments to out-of-school suspensions during the four years of the study, Grade 6 Black girls were assigned 0.75 days more to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 6 White girls. Hispanic girls in the same grade were assigned 0.23 days more to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 6 White girls (White, 2019). From 2012-2016, Grade 7 Black girls were assigned over a day more to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 7 White Girls. Hispanic Grade 7 girls were assigned almost half a day more to out-of-school suspensions than were Grade 7 White girls during the same four-year period (White, 2019). Grade 8 Black girls were assigned almost a day more for to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 8 White girls whereas Grade 8 Hispanic girls were assigned almost half a day more for the same disciplinary assignment during the same four-year period of the study.

The reason why numbers of days assigned to exclusionary discipline consequences matters is that such assignments can adversely affect academic and social outcomes. Evidence for this statement comes from another Texas statewide investigation in which Hilberth (2010) addressed the degree to which exclusionary discipline consequences assigned to Grade 6, 7, and 8 Black and White students were connected to their reading and mathematics achievement scores on the Texas state-mandated assessment. Grades 6, 7, and 8 Black and White students who were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence had statistically significantly lower reading and mathematics scores on the Texas state-mandated assessments than did their grade level counterparts who were not assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence. Grade 6, 7, and 8 Black and White students who had 10 or more exclusionary discipline assignments obtained lower reading and mathematics scores than their grade level counterparts who were assigned between 1 and 10 exclusionary discipline assignments.

Over 30% of students who receive either one or more suspensions or expulsions repeat the same grade at least once, and almost 10% of students who receive at least one disciplinary assignment drop out of school (Fabelo et al., 2011). Students who are assigned exclusionary discipline consequences experience achievement and opportunity gaps, an increased likelihood of dropping out of school, grade level retention, and an increased participation with the criminal justice system (Gregory, Skiba & Noguera, 2010; Martin, Sharp-Grier & Smith, 2016; Riddle & Sinclair, 2019; Skiba et al., 2011).

1.1 Statement of the Problem

Disproportionality of exclusionary discipline consequence for middle school boys has been recognized as a function of student ethnicity/race (e.g., Barnes & Slate, 2016; Coleman & Slate, 2016; Eckford & Slate, 2016; White & Slate, 2018), and high school boys (Miller & Slate, 2019; White & Slate, 2018). Researchers (e.g., Henkel, Slate, & Martinez-Garcia, 2016; Hilberth & Slate, 2014, White, 2019) have recently begun to focus on inequities of exclusionary discipline for girls as well. These researchers have demonstrated that girls of color receive a disproportionate amount of exclusionary discipline. Most of the researchers in these studies, however, have focused on middle school students. At present, only one published study was located in Texas (White, 2019) about the ethnicity/race of girls and being assigned to days in an exclusionary discipline consequence. This study pertained to middle school students as well. At present, no published articles were located in which researchers had focused on this issue for girls at the high school level in Texas. Because disparities exist in discipline assignment for Black and Hispanic students (Miller & Slate, 2019; Ryan & Goodram, 2013; White & Slate, 2018, White, 2019), examining the number of days girls are assigned to exclusionary discipline consequence is needed. Attention on the extent to which inequities might also exist in the amount of time Black and Hispanic Grade 9, 10, and 11 girls are assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence were determined. Gaining this information is vital because students who are assigned exclusionary discipline consequences experience lower academic performance, improved likelihood of dropping out of school, increased risk of grade level retention, and increased difficulties with the criminal justice system (Gregory et al., 2010; Riddle & Sinclair, 2019; Skiba et al., 2011).

1.2 Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to determine the degree in which the number of days that Texas Grade 9, 10, and 11 girls assigned an exclusionary discipline consequence (i.e., in-school suspension, out-of-school suspension), differed by their ethnicity/race (i.e., White, Hispanic, and Black) for the following four school years (i.e., 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018). A second purpose of this study is to determine the extent to which trends were present between the number of days girls were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence and their ethnicity/race. By performing these analyses, the extent to which inequities are present in days assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence based on the ethnicity/race of Texas high school girls were determined.

1.3 Significance of the Study

The information from this research investigation can be used by educational leaders and practitioners, to change school policies at the district and campus levels to reduce or eliminate the disparity in the use of exclusionary discipline as a behavior modification tool for Grade 9, 10, and 11 girls in Texas high schools. Researchers can use results from these analyses to modify curriculum used to train current and future educators to prepare them in dealing with students in the fields of cultural awareness, child development, and behavior modification techniques. Informed with the data in this study state legislators can make informative decisions in either eliminating or creating laws which aid in reducing or eliminating the use of exclusionary discipline consequences that are statistically significantly higher for students of color or students living in poverty.

1.4 Research Questions

The following research questions were addressed in this study: (a) For Grade 9 girls who were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence (i.e., in-school suspension, out-of-school suspension), what is the effect of their ethnicity/race (i.e., Black, Hispanic, and White) on the number of days they were assigned each of these consequences?; (b) For Grade 10 girls who were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence, what is the effect of their ethnicity/race on the number of days they were assigned each of these consequences?; (c) For Grade 11 girls who were assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence, what is the effect of their ethnicity/race on the number of days they were assigned each of these consequences?; (d) For Grade 9 girls, what trend is present in the relationship between their ethnicity/race and number of days they were assigned to the two exclusionary discipline consequences?; (e) For Grade 10 girls, what trend is present in the relationship between their ethnicity/race and number of days they were assigned to the two exclusionary discipline consequences?; and (f) For Grade 11 girls, what trend is present in the relationship between their ethnicity/race and number of days they were assigned to the two exclusionary discipline consequences? The first three research questions were examined for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018 school years whereas the last three research questions involved comparisons of data across the four school years.

2. Method

2.1 Research Design

Because archival data were analyzed, a causal comparative research design were present (Johnson & Christensen, 2020). In causal, non-experimental research investigations, no variables, are controlled. Consequently, the extent to which cause-and-effect relationships can be determined is constrained. Statewide archival data that were earlier obtained from the Texas Education Agency Public Education Information Management System were analyzed. Because the data had already been collected, the dependent and independent variables had already occurred and cannot be manipulated. For these reasons, the research design used in this study were a causal comparative research design (Johnson & Christensen, 2020). The data included Grade 9, Grade 10, and Grade 11 girls by their ethnicity/race, assignment to in-school suspension, assignment to out-of-school suspension, and the number of days obtained for each assigned exclusionary discipline consequence. Accordingly, the independent variable of ethnicity/race for girls consisted of three groups: (a) Black, (b) Hispanic, and (c) White. For each school year (i.e., 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018), the dependent variable was the number of days assigned to any of the two exclusionary discipline consequences.

2.2 Participants and Instrumentation

Participants in this study were Grade 9, Grade 10, and Grade 11, Black, Hispanic, and White girls in Texas who have were assigned an exclusionary discipline consequence of in-school suspension or out-of-school suspension for the following school years; 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018. The Texas Education Code contains all laws and rules passed by the Texas State Legislature. This code pertains to all educational organizations supported in whole or in part by state tax funds unless specifically excluded by this code (Texas Education Agency, 2019c). Chapter 37 of the Texas Education Code concerns school discipline.

Texas Education Code §37.001 (2019) pertains to the conditions and outlines the circumstances for using in-school and out-of-school suspensions. Information on in-school suspensions are located in Texas Education

Code §37.002. In order to maintain effective discipline, a teacher may remove a student from their assigned classroom and the administrator can assign the student in-school-suspension. Information about out-of-school suspensions is located in Texas Education Code §37.005. An out-of-school suspension is a discipline assignment that removes a student from the school campus for no longer than three consecutive days. Every year, each public-school district in the State of Texas must submit data pertaining to in-school and out-of-school suspensions to the Public Education Information Management System. The Public Education Information Management System encompasses all data requested and received by the Texas Education Agency about public education, including student demographic and academic performance, personnel, financial, and organizational information (Texas Education Agency, 2019d).

3. Results

In this study, the extent to which the number of days assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence related to the ethnicity/race of girls was analyzed. Data were evaluated for Texas Grade 9, 10, and 11 White, Hispanic, and Black girls who had been assigned to an in-school suspension or to an out-of-school suspension in the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018 school years. Separate statistical analyses were performed for in-school suspension and out-of-school suspension at each grade level and for each school year. Prior to conducting inferential statistical procedures to answer the research questions, checks for normality of data and for homogeneity of variance were conducted. Although some of the underlying assumptions of a parametric Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) were not met, Field (2018) contends that it is sufficiently robust to withstand violations of its underlying assumptions. Beginning with Grade 9, results are listed by ascending order of punishment severity (i.e., in-school suspension, out-of-school suspension) for Black, Hispanic, and White girls, beginning with the 2015-2016 school year and through the end of the 2017-2018 school year. Results are then repeated for Grade 10 and Grade 11 girls.

3.1 Results for Grade 9 Girls and In-School Suspension

With respect to the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 27849) = 50.99$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .004$, in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. The effect size for this finding was below small (Cohen, 1988). Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.72 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.70 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.02 more days than were Grade 9 White girls. Presented in Table 1 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics for In-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 9 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	6,668	4.65	5.69
Hispanic	16,310	3.95	4.79
White	4,874	3.93	4.55
2016-2017			
Black	6,380	4.65	5.72
Hispanic	15,640	3.88	4.69
White	4,642	3.86	4.48
2017-2018			
Black	5,765	4.36	5.51
Hispanic	14,202	3.66	4.34
White	4,630	3.92	4.47

Regarding the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 26659) = 60.16$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .004$, in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. The effect size for this finding was below small (Cohen, 1988). Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black

girls were assigned an average of 0.79 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.77 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.02 more days than were Grade 9 White girls. Table 1 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Regarding the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 24594) = 46.41$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .004$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.44 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.70 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.26 less days than were Grade 9 White girls. Delineated in Table 1 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

3.2 Results for Grade 10 Girls and In-School Suspension

Concerning the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 21947) = 54.22$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .005$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.36 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.69 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.33 less days than were Grade 10 White girls. Revealed in Table 2 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 2. Descriptive Statistics for In-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 10 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	5,270	3.89	4.63
Hispanic	11,577	3.20	3.73
White	4,203	3.53	4.09
2016-2017			
Black	4,769	3.85	4.61
Hispanic	11,043	3.23	3.94
White	3,796	3.34	3.76
2017-2018			
Black	4,332	3.84	4.61
Hispanic	10,426	3.06	3.46
White	3,924	3.26	3.40

In respect to the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 19605) = 38.19$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .004$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significantly different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.51 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.62 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.11 less days than were Grade 10 White girls. Presented in Table 2 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Concerning the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 18679) = 67.59$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .007$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.58 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.78 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an

average of 0.20 less days than were Grade 10 White girls. Presented in Table 2 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

3.3 Results for Grade 11 Girls and In-School Suspension

Regarding the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 14252) = 40.32$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .006$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.32 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.61 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.29 less days than were Grade 11 White girls. Delineated in Table 3 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 3. Descriptive Statistics for In-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 11 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	3,811	3.35	4.06
Hispanic	7,387	2.74	3.10
White	3,066	3.03	3.48
2016-2017			
Black	3,579	3.21	3.83
Hispanic	7,413	2.71	3.08
White	2,952	2.95	3.10
2017-2018			
Black	3,151	3.20	3.78
Hispanic	6,800	2.67	2.90
White	2,959	2.98	3.26

Concerning the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 13941) = 28.88$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .004$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.26 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.50 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.24 less days than were Grade 11 White girls. Table 3 contains the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

With respect to the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 12907) = 32.19$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .005$, below small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an in-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.22 more days to an in-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.53 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an in-school suspension an average of 0.31 less days than were Grade 11 White girls. Table 3 contains the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

3.4 Results for Grade 9 Girls and Out-of-School Suspension

Concerning the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 13372) = 77.08$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .011$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned an average of 1.19 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.61 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension

an average of 0.58 more days than were Grade 9 White girls. Revealed in Table 4 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 4. Descriptive Statistics for Out-of-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 9 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	4,575	4.21	4.03
Hispanic	7,188	3.60	3.48
White	1,612	3.02	2.47
2016-2017			
Black	4,381	4.36	4.41
Hispanic	6,975	3.47	3.11
White	1,628	3.08	2.54
2017-2018			
Black	4,194	4.16	3.80
Hispanic	6,384	3.45	3.15
White	1,756	3.12	2.72

Regarding the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 12981) = 114.94$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .017$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned an average of 1.28 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.89 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.39 more days than were Grade 9 White girls. Table 4 contains the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Concerning the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 12781) = 83.48$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .013$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 9 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that comparisons between all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned an average of 1.04 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 9 White girls and an average of 0.71 more days than Grade 9 Hispanic girls. Grade 9 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.33 more days than were Grade 9 White girls. Delineated in Table 4 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

3.5 Results for Grade 10 Girls and Out-of-School Suspension

With respect to the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 8889) = 83.09$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .018$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.92 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.74 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.18 more days than were Grade 10 White girls. Presented in Table 5 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 5. Descriptive Statistics for Out-of-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 10 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	3.364	3.67	3.19

Hispanic	4,249	2.93	2.55
White	1,279	2.75	2.57
2016-2017			
Black	3,060	3.53	2.86
Hispanic	4,041	2.47	2.46
White	1,172	2.83	2.25
2017-2018			
Black	3,063	3.56	2.87
Hispanic	4,107	2.93	2.16
White	1,315	2.82	1.96

Regarding the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 8270) = 52.25$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .012$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.70 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.56 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.14 more days than were Grade 10 White girls. Delineated in Table 5 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Concerning the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 8482) = 72.17$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .017$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 10 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 10 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.74 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 10 White girls and an average of 0.63 more days than Grade 10 Hispanic girls. Grade 10 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.11 more days than were Grade 10 White girls. Revealed in Table 5 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

3.6 Results for Grade 11 Girls and Out-of-School Suspension

Regarding the 2015-2016 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 5620) = 72.46$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .025$, large effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.81 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.72 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.09 more days than were Grade 11 White girls. Table 6 contains the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Table 6. Descriptive Statistics for Out-of-School Suspension Days Assigned to Grade 11 Black, Hispanic, and White Girls for 2015-2016 through 2017-2018

School Year and Ethnicity/Race	*n*	*M*	*SD*
2015-2016			
Black	2,327	3.36	2.84
Hispanic	2,374	2.64	1.85
White	878	2.55	1.60
2016-2017			
Black	2,191	3.25	2.56
Hispanic	2,368	2.63	1.83
White	860	2.64	1.68
2017-2018			

Black	2,066	3.15	2.33
Hispanic	2,355	2.64	1.82
White	845	2.66	1.77

With respect to the 2016-2017 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 5416) = 54.89$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .02$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that all pairwise comparisons were statistically significant different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.61 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.62 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.01 less days than were Grade 11 White girls. Presented in Table 6 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

Concerning the 2017-2018 school year, the parametric ANOVA yielded a statistically significant difference, $F(2, 5263) = 38.82$, $p < .001$, partial $n^2 = .015$, small effect size (Cohen, 1988), in the number of days Black, Hispanic, and White Grade 11 girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. The effect size for this finding was small (Cohen, 1988). Scheffe` post hoc procedures revealed that comparisons between all three ethnic/racial group pairwise comparisons were statistically significantly different. Grade 11 Black girls were assigned an average of 0.49 more days to an out-of-school suspension than were Grade 11 White girls and an average of 0.51 more days than Grade 11 Hispanic girls. Grade 11 Hispanic girls were assigned to an out-of-school suspension an average of 0.02 less days than were Grade 11 White girls. Delineated in Table 6 are the descriptive statistics for this analysis.

4. Discussion

In this investigation, the extent to which inequalities were present in the number of days assigned to an in-school suspension and an out-of-school suspension based on the ethnicity/race of Grade 9, 10, and 11 girls during the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018 school years was addressed. Inferential statistical procedures were used to answer the research questions. Results are reviewed by grade level. Over the three school years in this study, the ethnicity/race of Grade 9 girls was statistically significantly related to a greater number of days they were assigned to an in-school suspension. In all analyses, Black girls were assigned the highest number of days to an in-school suspension, followed by White girls, with the exception of the 2017-2018 school year, where Grade 9 White girls were assigned slightly more days to an-in-school suspension than Grade 9 Hispanic girls.

Concerning the three school years, the ethnicity/race of Grade 10 girls was statistically significantly related to the number of days they were assigned to an in-school suspension. In the analyses for the three school years, Grade 10 Black girls were assigned to the highest number of days followed by White girls, and then by Hispanic girls. Similar to Grade 9, Black girls had the highest average number of days assigned to an in-school suspension. Grade 10 White girls had the next highest average number of days assigned to an in-school-suspension followed by Grade 10 Hispanic girls with the lowest number of days assigned.

In regard to all three school years the ethnicity/race of Grade 11 girls was statistically significantly related to the number of days they were assigned to an in-school suspension. For all analyses, Grade 11 Black girls were assigned to the highest number of days, followed by White girls, and then by Hispanic girls. With respect to all three school years, the ethnicity/race of Grade 9 girls was statistically significantly related to the number of days they were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Grade 9 Black girls were assigned to the highest number of days of out-of-school suspensions, followed by Hispanic girls, and then by White girls.

Concerning all three school years, the ethnicity/race of Grade 10 girls was statistically significantly related to the number of days assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Black girls were assigned to the highest number of days, followed by Hispanic girls, with the exception of the 2016-2017 school year, and then by White girls. With respect to the three school years, the ethnicity/race Grade 11 girls was statistically significantly related to the number of days they were assigned to an out-of-school suspension. Concerning all analyses, Black girls were assigned the highest number of days, followed by White girls, with the exception of the 2015-2016 school year, and then by Hispanic girls.

4.1 Connections with Existing Literature

Established in this multiyear, statewide investigation, were the differences in the number of days assigned to an in-school suspension and out-of-school suspension for Grade 9, 10, and 11 girls by their ethnicity/race. These differences are congruent with documented research in the existing literature. Several researchers (e.g., Barnes et al. 2017; White & Slate, 2018; White 2019; Miller & Slate, 2019) have conducted research investigations in which they have identified the presence of inequities in exclusionary disciplinary consequence assignments by

student ethnicity/race in the State of Texas. Conclusions from their investigations of ethnic/racial inequalities in the assignment of exclusionary discipline consequences were consistent with the studies at the national level. Only two articles by White and Slate (2018) and by Miller and Slate (2019) were identified in which inequalities in the number of days assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence were addressed at the high school level. In both articles, however, disparities were addressed for boys and not for girls.

4.2 Implications for Policy and for Practice

As supported in this investigation, several implications for policy and for practice can be formulated. In regard to policy, laws should be examined and possibly altered to limit the amount of exclusionary discipline consequences school administrators can assign to students in an academic school year. The training and certification of future educators should be modified to focus on strategies designed to identify and reduce conflict which can ultimately lead to the assignment of disciplinary consequences. Secondly, current district and campus administrators need to employ programs intended to alter behavior outside the realm of disciplinary assignments, primarily exclusionary discipline consequences. Educational leaders need to implement professional development programs for staff and teachers that instill the skills necessary to build relationships with students which address cultural awareness and social and emotional learning development.

Concerning implications for practice, campus and district leaders need to examine trends in disciplinary assignments and share this information to staff members to assist them in determining what specific circumstances and resulting behaviors lead to discipline consequences. By identifying which groups of students receive an unequal amount of discipline consequences, campus and district leaders can provide social and emotional learning tools and positive behavior interventions and supports on their campuses to help keep students in the classroom. Secondly, campus and district leaders need to meet regularly with parents and guardians to build teams and create cooperative strategies to ensure all children are successful behaviorally and academically at home and in the classroom. Communication and the ability to train together using the same behavioral modification strategies at home and on the campus need to be explored and used to determine if consistent use of researched behavioral strategies improve social emotional development and proper behavior. Lastly, district and campus leaders should also cooperate and coordinate with local college and university researchers and practitioners to study and implement trends and programs that help reduce discipline infractions and build stronger bonds with the community.

4.3 Recommendations for Future Research

In this multiyear, statewide study, the relationship between student ethnicity/race and the number of days assigned to in-school suspension and out-of-school suspension for girls in Grades 9, 10, and 11 was examined. As such, a number of recommendations for future research can be made. First, an investigation is warranted to ascertain whether inequities in the number of days assigned to exclusionary discipline consequences also exists for Texas high school boys based on their ethnicity/race. Performing such a study would reveal the extent to which results presented in this study on girls would be generalizable to high school boys. Second, another recommendation is for researchers to extend this research to Texas high school girls based on their economic status. Third, researchers should expand this study into the elementary and middle school levels to determine if inequities as a function of ethnicity/race for girls apply at those levels as well. Fourth, researchers should apply the methods of this study to determine if inequalities exist with the more severe exclusionary discipline consequences such as Disciplinary Alternative Education Program placements and Juvenile Justice Alternative Education Program placements. Finally, research beyond Texas needs to be performed to ascertain if the inequities documented herein in the assignment of exclusionary consequences as a function of ethnicity/race and economic status also occur in other states.

5. Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to determine the degree to which inequities existed in the number of days assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence for Texas high school girls as a function of their ethnicity/race. Three years of archival data were acquired from the Texas Education Agency Public Education Information Management System for statewide data on all Grade 9, 10, and 11 Black, Hispanic, and White girls for the 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018 school years. In all three grades across all three school years, Black girls were assigned to the highest number of days in an in-school suspension, followed by White girls, with the exception of the Grade 9 for the 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 school years, and then by Hispanic girls. For all three grade levels across the three school years Black girls were assigned the most days of out-of-school suspensions, followed by Hispanic girls, with the exception of Grade 10 for the 2016-2017 school year, and Grade 11 for the 2016-2017 and 2017-2018 school years, then White girls. Findings of this study were congruent with findings of other researchers (Miller & Slate, 2019; White & Slate, 2018) in regard to the existence of inequities in the number of days students were assigned to exclusionary discipline consequences at the high school level.

References

Annamma, S. A., Anyon, Y., Joseph, M. J., Farrar, J., Greer, E., Downing, B., & Simmons, J., (2016). Black girls and school discipline: The complexities of being overrepresented and understudied. *Urban Education, 54*(2), 211-242. https://doi.org/10.1077/0042085916646610.

Barnes, M. J., & Slate, J. R., (2016). Grade 4 and Grade 5 inequities in disciplinary consequences by ethnicity/race and gender. *Journal of Global Research in Education and Social Science, 5*(4), 216-221.

Barnes, M. J., Slate, J. R., Moore, G. W., & Martinez-Garcia, C., (2017). Disciplinary consequence assignment differences by student ethnicity/race and gender: A Texas statewide investigation. *Social Science Review, 3*(2), 1-18.

Blake, J. J., Keith, V. M., Luo, W., Le, H., & Salter, P., (2016). The role of colorism in explaining African American females' suspension risk. *School Psychology Quarterly, 32*(1), 118-130. http:dx.doi.org/10.1037/spq0000173.

Cohen, J., (1988). *Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences* (2nd ed.). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Coleman, C. L., & Slate, J. R., (2016). Inequities in disciplinary reasons and consequences by ethnicity/race and economic status for Grade 6 students in Texas. *Journal of Global Research in Education and Social Science, 9*(1). Retrieved from http://www.ikpress.org/articles-press/46.

Eckford, C., & Slate, J. R., (2016). Differences in disciplinary consequence for Texas middle school boys as a function of ethnicity/race and economic status. *Global Journal of Human-Social Science, 16*(8), 43-47.

Fabelo, T., Thompson, M. D., Plotkin, M., Carmichael, D., Marchbanks, M.P., & Booth, E. A., (2011). *Breaking schools' rules: A statewide study of how school discipline relates to students' success and juvenile justice involvement*. New York, NY: Council of State Governments Justice Center.

Field, A., (2018). *Discovering statistics using SPSS* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Gregory, A., Skiba, R., & Noguera, P., (2010). The achievement gap and the discipline gap: Two sides of the same coin? *Educational Researcher*, *39*(1), 59-68. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X09357621.

Henkel, B. L., Slate, J. R., & Martinez-Garcia, C., (2016). Out-of-school suspension and differences in reading and mathematics achievement by gender and ethnicity/race. *Journal of Ethical Educational Leadership, 3*(2), 1-27. Retrieved from http://cojeel.org/?page_id=37.

Hilberth, M., (2010). *Black and White Texas middle school student discipline referral consequences and their relationship to academic achievement.* (Order No.). Available from Dissertations & Theses @ Sam Houston State University.

Hilberth, M., & Slate, J. R., (2014). Middle school Black and White student assignment to disciplinary consequences: A clear lack of equity. *Education & Urban Society, 46*, 312-328. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124512446218.

Johnson, R. B., & Christensen, L., (2020). *Educational research: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches* (7th.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Martin, J. L., Sharp-Grier, M., & Smith, J. B., (2016). Alternative realities: Racial disparate discipline in classrooms and schools and its effect on Black and Brown students. *Leadership and Research in Education, 3*(1), 16-33.

Miller, B. J., & Slate, J. R., (2019). Inequities in days assigned to out-of-school suspension by ethnicity/race: A Texas, statewide analysis. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Education, 1*(1), 29-33. Retrieved from http://www.humanitiesjournals.com/article/view/5/1-2-11.

Morris, E. W., & Perry, B. L., (2017). Girls behaving badly? Race, gender, and subjective evaluation in the discipline of African American girls. *Sociology of Education, 90*(2), 127-148. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038040717694876.

Office for Civil Rights, (2016). Data collection: US public schools. Retrieved from http://ocrdata.ed.gov/.

Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Daniel, L. G., (2002). Uses and misuses of the correlation coefficient. *Research in the Schools, 9*(1), 73-90.

Riddle, T., & Sinclair, S., (2019). Racial disparities in school-based disciplinary actions are associated with county-level rates of racial bias. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 116*(17), 8255-8260. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1808307116.

Ryan, T. G., & Goodram, B., (2013). The impact of exclusionary discipline on students. *International Journal of*

Progressive Education, 9(3), 169-177.

Skiba, R. J., Horner, R. H., Chung, C., Rausch, M. K., May, S. L., & Tobin, T., (2011). Race is not neutral: A national investigation of African American and Latino disproportionality in school discipline. *School Psychology Review, 40*(1), 85-107. Retrieved from http://www.nasponline.org/publications/spr/spr401index.aspx.

Slate, J. R., Gray, P. L., & Jones, B., (2016). A clear lack of equity in disciplinary consequences for Black girls in Texas: A statewide examination. *The Journal of Negro Education, 85*, 250-260. https://doi.org/10.7709/jnegroeducation.85.3.0250.

Slate, J. R., & Rojas-LeBouef, A., (2011). *Calculating basic statistical procedures in SPSS: A self-help and practical guide to preparing theses, dissertations, and manuscripts.* Ypsilanti, MI: NCPEA Press.

Texas Education Agency, (2019c). *Enrollment in Texas public schools, 2018-19.* (Document No. GE19 601 13). Austin TX: Author. Retrieved from http://tea.texas.gov/acctres/Enroll_2018-19.pdf.

Texas Education Agency, (2019d). *PEIMS-overview.* Retrieved from https://tea.texas.gov/reports-and-data/data-submission/peims/peims-overview.

White, J. W., (2019). Inequities in the number of days assigned to an exclusionary discipline consequence as a function of Ethnicity/Race and economic status of Texas middle school students: A multiyear, statewide investigation (Order No.). Available from Dissertations & Theses @ Sam Houston State University.

White, J. W., & Slate, J. R., (2018). Differences in out-of-school suspension assignments by the ethnicity/race of Texas high school students. *Inaugural Edition of the Journal of Educational System, 2*(1), 1-8. Retrieved from http://www.sryahwapublications.com/journal-of-educational-system/pdf/v2-i1/1.pdf.

Copyrights