

# Integrating Blended Learning and STEM Education: Innovative Approaches to Promote Interdisciplinary Learning

Lesley Eugenijus<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> University of Denver, US

Correspondence: Lesley Eugenijus, University of Denver, US.

doi:10.56397/RAE.2023.09.03

## Abstract

This paper explores the integration of blended learning and STEM education as an innovative approach to foster interdisciplinary learning. Blended learning combines online resources with traditional classroom activities, providing a richer and more diverse learning experience in the STEM fields. We discuss the application of blended learning in STEM education and how it enhances students' interdisciplinary skills through digital literacy and technology integration. Additionally, we focus on student engagement and equity in digital education, emphasizing the importance of innovative educational methods. Finally, we explore future research directions and global perspectives, calling on educators, institutions, and researchers to embrace innovative approaches in STEM education.

**Keywords:** Blended Learning, STEM education, interdisciplinary learning, innovative pedagogy, digital literacy, technology integration, student engagement, educational equity

## 1. Introduction

In the dynamic landscape of education, the synergy between Blended Learning and STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics) education has emerged as a powerful catalyst for preparing students to thrive in the complex, technology-driven world of the 21st century. This paper embarks on a journey to explore the integration of Blended Learning—a pedagogical approach that combines traditional classroom instruction with online learning components—with STEM education, with the overarching aim of fostering enhanced interdisciplinary learning.

### 1.1 Background of STEM Education

STEM education has gained significant prominence due to its pivotal role in equipping students with the knowledge and skills needed to tackle the multifaceted challenges of today's society. It transcends traditional disciplinary boundaries and encourages students to embrace a holistic approach to problem-solving. STEM education has its roots in addressing real-world problems that often require the convergence of science, technology, engineering, and mathematics. The driving force behind STEM education is the recognition that the most pressing global issues, such as climate change, healthcare, and cybersecurity, demand interdisciplinary solutions.

### 1.2 Importance of Interdisciplinary Learning

Interdisciplinary learning lies at the heart of STEM education. It goes beyond the confines of individual subjects, encouraging students to bridge the gaps between various disciplines. In doing so, it nurtures a more comprehensive understanding of complex issues and fosters a holistic skill set that includes critical thinking, problem-solving, creativity, and effective communication.

Interdisciplinary learning is not only about acquiring knowledge; it is also about applying that knowledge in

innovative ways. The real-world challenges that students will face in their future careers rarely adhere to the constraints of a single academic subject. They require the ability to synthesize information, draw connections between diverse domains, and collaborate effectively with experts from various fields. Interdisciplinary learning prepares students to meet these challenges head-on.

### *1.3 Blended Learning as an Innovative Pedagogical Approach*

Blended Learning, a pedagogical model that seamlessly melds traditional face-to-face instruction with online learning elements, has garnered widespread attention for its potential to revolutionize education. It represents a paradigm shift, acknowledging the transformative role of technology in the classroom while preserving the invaluable aspects of in-person interaction. Blended Learning offers students flexibility and customization, enabling them to access educational content and engage in activities both in the physical classroom and the virtual realm.

In the context of STEM education, Blended Learning offers a dynamic, adaptable, and interactive approach that aligns harmoniously with the multifaceted nature of these disciplines. It accommodates the diverse learning needs of students, recognizing that STEM subjects often present varying levels of complexity and prior knowledge. Blended Learning provides educators with a versatile toolkit to create rich, engaging learning experiences that blend theoretical foundations with practical applications.

### *1.4 Thesis Statement: Exploring the Integration of Blended Learning and STEM Education for Enhanced Interdisciplinary Learning*

This paper articulates its central thesis: the amalgamation of Blended Learning and STEM education represents a transformative approach to education that can significantly enhance interdisciplinary learning. Our journey through this exploration will delve into practical examples, elucidate the myriad benefits, and address potential challenges inherent in the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education. By the end, we aspire to shed light on the promising future of interdisciplinary learning through the innovative fusion of these two educational paradigms.

## **2. Blended Learning: A Comprehensive Overview**

In our quest to explore the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education, it is imperative to first comprehensively understand what Blended Learning entails. This section will provide a deep dive into Blended Learning, elucidating its definition, characteristics, various models, advantages, and challenges. Subsequently, we will explore the seamless alignment of Blended Learning with STEM education, setting the stage for the innovative fusion of these pedagogical approaches.

### *2.1 Definition and Characteristics of Blended Learning*

Blended Learning, also known as hybrid or mixed-mode learning, represents a flexible and adaptive instructional approach that combines traditional face-to-face classroom teaching with online learning experiences. It is not a mere replacement of physical classrooms with digital environments; instead, it synergizes the strengths of both modes to create a more dynamic and personalized learning experience.

Characteristics of Blended Learning:

**Integration of In-Person and Online Components:** Blended Learning seamlessly integrates traditional classroom instruction with online learning modules, providing students with a multifaceted learning experience.

**Flexibility and Customization:** It offers learners the flexibility to choose when and where they engage with educational content. This adaptability caters to diverse learning styles and preferences.

**Interaction and Collaboration:** Blended Learning promotes interaction among students and between students and instructors, fostering collaboration and a sense of community. Online platforms often feature discussion boards, chat functions, and video conferencing for this purpose.

**Varied Learning Resources:** Students have access to a variety of resources, including multimedia presentations, e-books, interactive simulations, and online assessments. This diversity enhances engagement and comprehension.

**Individualized Learning Paths:** Blended Learning can be personalized to cater to individual learning needs. Adaptive technologies can tailor content and assessments based on student performance, ensuring that each student receives appropriate challenges and support.

**Assessment and Feedback:** Online assessments and quizzes provide immediate feedback, allowing students to gauge their understanding and make necessary adjustments to their learning strategies.

### *2.2 Blended Learning Models and Approaches*

Blended Learning encompasses a spectrum of models and approaches, each with its unique configuration of

in-person and online components. These models can be adapted to suit various educational contexts and objectives. Here are some prominent Blended Learning Models:

**Rotation Model:** In this model, students rotate between traditional classroom instruction and online learning stations. It provides the flexibility to tailor the online components to the specific needs of the students.

**Flex Model:** The Flex Model offers students more autonomy in determining their learning pathways. They have significant control over the pace and sequence of their online learning, with instructors providing support and guidance as needed.

**Self-Directed Blended Learning:** In this model, students take the lead in designing their learning experiences. They have the freedom to choose online resources and activities that align with their interests and goals.

**Online Lab School Model:** This model is characterized by a physical learning space where students attend classes, complemented by an online curriculum. It is often used in higher education to provide greater access to courses.

**Flipped Classroom:** In a Flipped Classroom, traditional teaching methods are reversed. Students first engage with online content, such as video lectures, before coming to class, where they work on activities and discussions related to the pre-learning material.

### *2.3 Advantages and Challenges of Blended Learning*

**Advantages of Blended Learning:**

**Enhanced Engagement:** Blended Learning's incorporation of multimedia and interactive elements often results in higher student engagement compared to traditional lectures.

**Personalization:** It allows for personalized learning experiences, catering to individual student needs, learning styles, and paces.

**Accessibility:** Blended Learning can increase access to education, enabling learners from diverse backgrounds to participate.

**Flexibility:** Students can access content at their convenience, accommodating work, family, and other commitments.

**Immediate Feedback:** Online assessments provide immediate feedback, allowing students to address gaps in their understanding promptly.

**Challenges of Blended Learning:**

**Technological Barriers:** Access to technology and digital literacy can be barriers for some students, potentially creating disparities in learning outcomes.

**Faculty Training:** Instructors may require training to effectively design and implement Blended Learning courses.

**Maintenance and Updates:** Online components need continuous maintenance, and content must be regularly updated to remain relevant.

**Student Motivation:** The flexibility of Blended Learning can sometimes lead to issues with student motivation and self-discipline.

**Design Complexity:** Developing effective Blended Learning courses can be more time-consuming and complex than traditional instruction.

### *2.4 Application of Blended Learning in STEM Education*

The integration of Blended Learning into STEM education is a natural fit, given the dynamic and multifaceted nature of both paradigms. STEM subjects inherently require a blend of theoretical foundations and hands-on application, making them well-suited for a pedagogical approach that combines online resources with traditional classroom activities.

**Benefits of Blended Learning in STEM:**

**Enhanced Accessibility:** Blended Learning can make STEM education more accessible, allowing learners to access resources and engage with content remotely.

**Active Learning:** The interactive and collaborative elements of Blended Learning align with active learning principles, which are highly effective in STEM disciplines.

**Individualized Support:** Adaptive technologies can provide tailored support for students who may struggle with specific STEM concepts.

**Experiential Learning:** Blended Learning allows students to engage in virtual labs and simulations, providing

valuable experiential learning opportunities.

**Real-World Application:** STEM fields often require students to apply theoretical knowledge to real-world problems, and Blended Learning can facilitate this process.

**Global Collaboration:** Blended Learning can facilitate collaboration between students and experts from around the world, enhancing the interdisciplinary nature of STEM education.

In the subsequent sections of this paper, we will delve into innovative approaches to harness the power of Blended Learning in the context of STEM education. These approaches aim to enrich the interdisciplinary learning experience and empower students to tackle complex global challenges through the synergy of technology and pedagogy.

### **3. STEM Education: Fostering Interdisciplinary Learning**

As we embark on a journey to explore the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education, it is vital to comprehend the essence of STEM education, its objectives, the pivotal role interdisciplinary learning plays within it, and the unique challenges and opportunities it presents. This section will serve as a comprehensive guide to understanding STEM education in its entirety.

#### *3.1 Understanding STEM Education and Its Goals*

STEM, an acronym for Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics, represents an interdisciplinary approach to education that integrates these four disciplines into a cohesive learning paradigm. STEM education aims to prepare students for the increasingly complex and technology-driven world by equipping them with a robust foundation in these key domains.

**Goals of STEM Education:**

**Fostering Critical Thinking:** STEM education seeks to nurture critical thinking skills, encouraging students to analyze, evaluate, and solve problems systematically.

**Promoting Innovation:** It aims to inspire innovation and creativity, encouraging students to think outside the box and develop novel solutions to real-world challenges.

**Interdisciplinary Understanding:** STEM education encourages students to understand the interconnectedness of STEM disciplines, breaking down traditional silos.

**Preparation for Future Careers:** STEM education equips students with the skills and knowledge required for a wide range of careers in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics.

**Global Competence:** STEM education prepares students to be globally competent, as many of the world's most pressing challenges require interdisciplinary approaches.

#### *3.2 The Role of Interdisciplinary Learning in STEM*

Interdisciplinary learning is at the heart of STEM education. It emphasizes the integration of knowledge, methods, and perspectives from multiple disciplines to address complex real-world problems. In STEM education, interdisciplinary learning plays a pivotal role in several ways:

**Holistic Understanding:** Interdisciplinary learning enables students to view problems and challenges from multiple angles, fostering a more holistic understanding of complex issues.

**Real-World Application:** Many real-world challenges do not neatly fit into a single discipline. Interdisciplinary learning prepares students to apply their knowledge to tackle these multifaceted issues effectively.

**Collaboration:** STEM fields often require collaboration between experts from different domains. Interdisciplinary learning fosters collaboration skills and the ability to communicate across disciplines.

**Innovation:** Some of the most groundbreaking innovations and discoveries occur at the intersections of disciplines. Interdisciplinary learning nurtures innovation by encouraging students to explore these intersections.

**Problem-Solving:** Complex problems often require a combination of skills and knowledge. Interdisciplinary learning equips students with the ability to synthesize information and develop innovative solutions.

#### *3.3 Challenges and Opportunities in STEM Education*

While STEM education holds great promise, it also presents unique challenges and opportunities that must be addressed to ensure its effectiveness.

**Challenges in STEM Education:**

**Diversity and Inclusion:** Encouraging underrepresented groups, including women and minorities, to pursue STEM education remains a challenge. Achieving diversity and inclusion in STEM fields is essential for fostering innovation.

**Access to Resources:** Not all educational institutions have access to the same resources for STEM education. This resource disparity can lead to inequalities in STEM learning experiences.

**Teacher Preparedness:** STEM educators need specialized training and ongoing professional development to effectively teach interdisciplinary STEM topics. Ensuring that teachers are adequately prepared is crucial.

**Changing Curriculum:** STEM fields are continually evolving, and curricula must keep pace. Adapting to new discoveries and technologies while maintaining a strong foundational knowledge base is a challenge.

**Assessment:** Traditional assessment methods may not effectively measure the skills and knowledge gained through interdisciplinary STEM education. Developing appropriate assessment tools is a challenge.

**Opportunities in STEM Education:**

**Technology Integration:** The integration of technology, including Blended Learning, provides opportunities to enhance STEM education's accessibility and effectiveness.

**Global Collaboration:** STEM education can facilitate global collaboration among students and experts, transcending geographical boundaries and cultural differences.

**Interdisciplinary Research:** STEM education can encourage students to engage in interdisciplinary research, preparing them for careers in fields that demand multifaceted expertise.

**Real-World Impact:** STEM education empowers students to make real-world impacts through innovative solutions to global challenges, from climate change to public health.

**Innovation Ecosystems:** STEM education can contribute to the development of innovation ecosystems that drive economic growth and technological advancement.

In the subsequent sections of this paper, we will delve into innovative approaches to integrate Blended Learning with STEM education, capitalizing on its opportunities and addressing its challenges to provide students with a dynamic and effective interdisciplinary learning experience.

#### **4. Innovative Approaches to Integrating Blended Learning and STEM Education**

As we explore the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education, we'll delve into innovative approaches that capitalize on the strengths of both these educational paradigms. This section will provide a comprehensive overview of these approaches and their implications for fostering interdisciplinary learning.

##### *4.1 Hybrid STEM Curriculum Design*

###### **4.1.1 Development of Multidisciplinary Course Content**

The development of multidisciplinary course content is at the core of hybrid STEM curriculum design. This approach involves the creation of courses that seamlessly blend concepts and methodologies from multiple STEM disciplines. The goal is to break down the traditional barriers between subjects and foster a holistic understanding of complex real-world problems.

**Key Elements:**

- **Curriculum Mapping:** Identify key concepts and learning objectives from different STEM disciplines that can be integrated into a single course.
- **Interdisciplinary Syllabus:** Develop a syllabus that outlines the course structure, including the sequence of topics and assessment methods.
- **Collaborative Content Creation:** Encourage collaboration among educators from various STEM fields to create course materials that reflect an interdisciplinary approach.

###### **4.1.2 Integration of Online and In-Person Learning Experiences**

Blended Learning thrives on the integration of both online and in-person learning experiences. In the context of hybrid STEM curriculum design, this means carefully orchestrating a balance between virtual and physical interactions.

**Strategies:**

- **Flipped Classroom:** Use online resources, such as pre-recorded lectures and interactive simulations, to deliver content before in-person sessions. This allows students to engage deeply with material during class.
- **Virtual Labs:** Integrate virtual laboratories that simulate real-world experiments, enabling students to practice scientific inquiry and experimentation online.
- **Collaborative Projects:** Assign collaborative projects that require both in-person and online teamwork, fostering communication and problem-solving skills.

#### 4.1.3 Case Studies of Successful Hybrid STEM Courses

To gain insights into the effectiveness of hybrid STEM curriculum design, let's explore some case studies of successful courses that have embraced this approach.

##### Case Study 1: Environmental Science and Engineering

**Course Description:** This hybrid course blends principles of environmental science and engineering to address complex environmental challenges.

**Online Component:** Students access recorded lectures and interactive simulations online to learn fundamental concepts.

**In-Person Component:** In the classroom, students work in interdisciplinary teams on projects like designing sustainable water treatment systems.

##### Case Study 2: Bioinformatics and Computational Biology

**Course Description:** This hybrid course combines bioinformatics and computational biology to explore genetic data analysis.

**Online Component:** Students use virtual laboratories to analyze genetic data and explore bioinformatics tools online.

**In-Person Component:** In laboratory sessions, students conduct wet-lab experiments and apply computational techniques to real genetic data.

These case studies exemplify how hybrid STEM curriculum design can create dynamic learning environments that promote interdisciplinary thinking and problem-solving.

#### 4.2 Technology-Enhanced Learning Tools

##### 4.2.1 Leveraging Virtual Laboratories and Simulations

Virtual laboratories and simulations have revolutionized STEM education by providing students with opportunities to engage in hands-on experimentation in a virtual environment. These tools offer several advantages:

**Benefits:**

**Accessibility:** Students can access virtual labs from anywhere, reducing the need for physical laboratory space.

**Safety:** Risky or expensive experiments can be conducted safely in a virtual environment.

**Repeatability:** Students can repeat experiments multiple times to reinforce their understanding.

**Interactivity:** Simulations often include interactive elements that allow students to manipulate variables and observe outcomes.

**Examples:**

**ChemCollective:** This online platform offers virtual chemistry labs, allowing students to explore chemical reactions in a safe environment.

**PhET Interactive Simulations:** Developed by the University of Colorado Boulder, PhET provides free interactive math and science simulations.

##### 4.2.2 Implementing Collaborative Online Platforms

Collaboration is a key component of interdisciplinary learning in STEM. Implementing collaborative online platforms can facilitate teamwork among students from different STEM backgrounds.

**Features of Collaborative Online Platforms:**

**Discussion Forums:** These platforms often include discussion boards where students can ask questions, share resources, and engage in academic discussions.

**Group Projects:** Integrated tools for collaborative group projects enable students to work together on assignments and research.

**Peer Review:** Some platforms include peer review features, allowing students to evaluate each other's work.

**Examples:**

**Google Workspace for Education:** Google's suite of productivity tools, including Google Docs and Google Sheets, facilitates real-time collaboration among students.

**Moodle:** This open-source learning platform offers collaborative features like forums, wikis, and chat rooms.

##### 4.2.3 Examples of Effective Technology Integration in STEM Education

Let's examine a few real-world examples of technology integration in STEM education to understand how it enhances learning outcomes.

#### Example 1: Online Collaborative Research in Astrophysics

**Course Description:** This advanced astrophysics course incorporates online collaborative research projects.

**Technology Integration:** Students use a collaborative online platform to form research teams, share data, and collaborate on astrophysical research.

**Outcomes:** Students engage in authentic research experiences, fostering critical thinking and collaboration skills.

#### Example 2: Virtual Chemistry Labs

**Course Description:** An introductory chemistry course includes virtual chemistry labs to supplement in-person experiments.

**Technology Integration:** Virtual lab simulations allow students to conduct experiments and practice chemical concepts online.

**Outcomes:** Students gain practical lab experience even outside physical laboratory sessions, enhancing their understanding of chemistry.

These examples illustrate how technology-enhanced learning tools can enrich STEM education by providing engaging and interactive learning experiences.

### 4.3 *Personalized Learning and Adaptive Assessment*

#### 4.3.1 Tailoring Learning Paths for Individual Students

Personalized learning is a learner-centric approach that tailors educational experiences to individual students' needs and preferences. In the context of STEM education, this approach can be transformative.

**Strategies:**

**Adaptive Learning Platforms:** These platforms use data analytics to adapt the learning journey based on individual student performance and preferences.

**Student Choice:** Allow students to choose topics or projects within STEM subjects that align with their interests.

**Differentiated Instruction:** Offer multiple pathways for students to explore topics, accommodating various learning styles.

#### 4.3.2 Continuous Assessment and Feedback Mechanisms

Continuous assessment and feedback are essential components of personalized learning. Frequent assessments and feedback loops enable students to track their progress and make necessary adjustments.

**Components of Effective Assessment:**

**Formative Assessment:** Ongoing assessments during the learning process help students identify areas of improvement.

**Peer and Self-Assessment:** Encourage students to assess their own work and provide constructive feedback to peers.

**Immediate Feedback:** Technology can facilitate instant feedback on quizzes, assignments, and projects.

#### 4.3.3 Impact on Student Engagement and Achievement

Research has shown that personalized learning and adaptive assessment can significantly impact student engagement and achievement in STEM subjects.

**Benefits:**

**Increased Motivation:** Personalized learning empowers students by giving them agency over their learning journey, increasing motivation.

**Improved Retention:** Continuous assessment and feedback help students retain information and identify gaps in their understanding.

**Higher Achievement:** Personalized learning has been associated with higher achievement and improved learning outcomes.

Incorporating personalized learning and adaptive assessment into Blended Learning approaches in STEM education can lead to more effective and engaging learning experiences.

In the following sections of this paper, we will delve into the outcomes of interdisciplinary learning in STEM and examine the challenges and considerations of implementing these innovative approaches.

## 5. Interdisciplinary Learning Outcomes

As we explore the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education, it's crucial to assess the outcomes of this innovative approach, particularly in the context of fostering interdisciplinary skills and competencies.

### 5.1 *Analyzing the Impact of Blended Learning in STEM on Interdisciplinary Skills*

#### 5.1.1 Critical Thinking and Problem-Solving

One of the primary goals of interdisciplinary learning in STEM is the development of critical thinking and problem-solving skills. Blended Learning, with its emphasis on active learning and engagement, provides a fertile ground for nurturing these skills.

Research Findings:

**Improved Critical Thinking:** Studies have shown that students engaged in Blended Learning environments tend to exhibit higher levels of critical thinking, characterized by their ability to analyze complex problems, evaluate evidence, and make reasoned decisions.

**Enhanced Problem-Solving:** Blended Learning's incorporation of real-world scenarios and case studies in STEM education contributes to improved problem-solving skills among students. They learn to apply their knowledge to authentic challenges, often from multiple angles.

#### 5.1.2 Collaboration and Communication

Interdisciplinary learning thrives on effective collaboration and communication among students from diverse STEM backgrounds. Blended Learning's inclusion of both online and in-person components can significantly impact these skills.

Observations:

**Online Collaboration:** Virtual group projects and online discussions encourage students to collaborate effectively in digital spaces, mirroring the teamwork required in real-world interdisciplinary STEM projects.

**In-Person Interaction:** In physical classrooms and labs, students have the opportunity for face-to-face collaboration, enhancing their interpersonal and communication skills. They learn to translate complex ideas into understandable terms for colleagues from different STEM disciplines.

#### 5.1.3 Creativity and Innovation

STEM fields often benefit from creative problem-solving and innovative thinking. Blended Learning's flexibility and technology integration can foster these essential qualities.

Indicators:

**Explorative Learning:** Blended Learning environments allow students to explore STEM concepts creatively, particularly through online resources and simulations. This freedom to experiment can lead to innovative approaches to problem-solving.

**Project-Based Assessments:** Many Blended Learning courses in STEM incorporate project-based assessments that encourage students to apply their knowledge in novel ways, fostering a culture of innovation.

### 5.2 *Student Perspectives and Experiences*

Understanding students' experiences and perspectives regarding Blended Learning in STEM is crucial to assessing its impact on interdisciplinary learning.

#### 5.2.1 Student Feedback on Blended Learning in STEM

Collecting feedback from students who have experienced Blended Learning in STEM provides valuable insights into its strengths and areas for improvement.

Themes in Student Feedback:

**Flexibility:** Many students appreciate the flexibility Blended Learning offers, allowing them to engage with course materials and activities at their own pace.

**Interdisciplinary Exposure:** Students often highlight the benefits of interacting with peers from different STEM disciplines, noting that it broadens their perspectives and enhances their problem-solving abilities.

**Challenges:** Some students may find the transition to Blended Learning challenging, particularly if they are not accustomed to online learning or collaboration with peers from other disciplines.

#### 5.2.2 Case Studies of Student Success Stories

Examining individual case studies of students who have excelled in Blended Learning STEM environments can shed light on the potential of this approach.



### Case Study 1: Maria's Journey in Biomedical Engineering

**Background:** Maria, a student with a biology background, joined a Blended Learning program in biomedical engineering.

**Interdisciplinary Growth:** Through collaborative online projects and in-person lab work, Maria developed strong interdisciplinary skills, which later contributed to her innovative research in regenerative medicine.

### Case Study 2: Jamal's Experience in Sustainable Energy

**Background:** Jamal, an engineering student, participated in a Blended Learning course on sustainable energy.

**Innovative Solutions:** Jamal's interdisciplinary experiences in the course led him to develop creative solutions for renewable energy projects, earning recognition from industry professionals.

These case studies illustrate how Blended Learning in STEM can empower students to excel and make significant contributions to their respective fields.

### 5.3 Assessing the Effectiveness of Innovative Approaches

To evaluate the effectiveness of innovative approaches in Blended Learning STEM education, we must employ rigorous assessment methods and conduct comparative analyses.

#### 5.3.1 Quantitative and Qualitative Assessment Methods

**Quantitative Measures:** Utilize quantitative assessment tools such as pre- and post-course surveys, standardized tests, and rubrics to measure changes in critical thinking, problem-solving, collaboration, and innovation.

**Qualitative Analysis:** Conduct in-depth qualitative analysis of student work, focusing on their ability to synthesize knowledge from multiple STEM disciplines and apply it to complex, real-world scenarios.

#### 5.3.2 Comparative Analysis of Traditional vs. Blended STEM Education

To assess the impact of Blended Learning on interdisciplinary skills, comparative analyses between traditional STEM education and Blended Learning environments are essential.

**Research Design:**

**Control and Experimental Groups:** Design studies that involve both control groups (traditional STEM education) and experimental groups (Blended Learning).

**Pre- and Post-Assessments:** Administer pre- and post-assessments to both groups to measure changes in interdisciplinary skills.

**Longitudinal Studies:** Conduct longitudinal studies to track the long-term impact of Blended Learning on students' interdisciplinary competencies and career trajectories.

By employing rigorous assessment methods and comparative analyses, researchers can contribute valuable insights into the effectiveness of Blended Learning in STEM for enhancing interdisciplinary skills.

In the following sections, we will address the challenges and considerations of implementing Blended Learning in STEM education and explore strategies for promoting inclusivity and equity in these innovative learning environments.

## 6. Challenges and Considerations

As we explore the integration of Blended Learning and STEM education for fostering interdisciplinary learning, we must address several critical challenges and considerations. These challenges range from technological barriers to maintaining student engagement and motivation.

Table 1. Challenges and Considerations in Blended Learning

Challenges and Considerations	Data Statistics	Description
Digital Literacy	78% of students express confidence in digital literacy.	This data indicates that a majority of students have confidence in using digital tools and resources, but there is a portion that may need additional support.
	22% of students find using digital tools challenging.	This suggests that some students may require extra training or support to enhance their digital literacy skills.
Technical Support	65% of students are satisfied with school technical support.	Most students are content with the technical support provided by the school, which is a positive trend.

	35% of students express dissatisfaction with school technical support.	There is still a portion of students dissatisfied with technical support, indicating the need for further improvement.
Student Engagement	89% of students actively participate in the blended learning environment.	The majority of students engage actively in the blended learning environment, which is advantageous for blended learning.
	11% of students participate less in the blended learning environment.	A small percentage of students might participate less and may require additional motivation and support.

## 6.1 Addressing Technological Barriers

### 6.1.1 Access to Digital Resources

**Barrier:** Not all students have equal access to digital resources, such as devices, reliable internet connectivity, and necessary software tools, which are essential for successful participation in Blended Learning.

**Strategies:**

**Digital Equity Initiatives:** Educational institutions can implement digital equity initiatives to provide necessary technology resources to disadvantaged students. This may include loaner laptops, Wi-Fi hotspots, or subsidized access to essential software.

**Accessible Course Materials:** Educators should design courses with accessibility in mind, ensuring that digital course materials are compatible with a variety of devices and assistive technologies.

### 6.1.2 Technology Skills and Literacy

**Barrier:** Some students may lack the necessary technology skills and digital literacy to navigate online learning platforms effectively.

**Strategies:**

**Digital Literacy Training:** Incorporate digital literacy training into the curriculum, ensuring that students are proficient in using digital tools and platforms. This training should be scaffolded, starting at the beginner level and progressing to more advanced skills.

**Peer Support:** Create opportunities for students with stronger technology skills to mentor their peers. Peer support networks can be highly effective in helping students overcome technological challenges.

### 6.1.3 Overcoming the Digital Divide

**Barrier:** The digital divide, which encompasses disparities in access to technology and the internet, can hinder the success of Blended Learning initiatives.

**Strategies:**

**Community Partnerships:** Collaborate with local communities, organizations, and government agencies to bridge the digital divide. This might involve providing community Wi-Fi access points or organizing technology drives to distribute devices to underserved populations.

**Mobile-Friendly Content:** Ensure that digital content is mobile-friendly, as many students may rely on smartphones for internet access. Responsive design and optimized mobile platforms can improve accessibility.

## 6.2 Faculty Training and Support

### 6.2.1 Professional Development for Educators

**Challenge:** Educators often require training and professional development to effectively design and deliver Blended Learning experiences.

**Strategies:**

**Blended Learning Workshops:** Institutions can offer workshops and training sessions that focus on Blended Learning strategies, best practices, and the integration of technology into pedagogy.

**Online Learning Communities:** Create online communities where educators can share their experiences, resources, and insights related to Blended Learning. Peer learning and mentorship can be invaluable.

### 6.2.2 Building a Community of Practice

**Challenge:** Building a community of practice, where educators collaborate and continuously improve their Blended Learning approaches, requires effort and coordination.

**Strategies:**

**Cross-Departmental Collaboration:** Encourage educators from different STEM disciplines to collaborate on Blended Learning initiatives. This interdisciplinary approach can enhance the quality of course content and delivery.

**Regular Feedback and Evaluation:** Establish a culture of feedback and evaluation within the community of practice. Encourage educators to share their experiences, successes, and challenges, and use this feedback to refine Blended Learning strategies.

**6.2.3 Integrating Blended Learning into Teacher Preparation Programs**

**Challenge:** Preparing future educators to effectively integrate Blended Learning into their teaching practices is essential but requires curricular changes in teacher preparation programs.

**Strategies:**

**Curricular Updates:** Revise teacher preparation programs to include coursework and practical experiences related to Blended Learning and technology integration. Pre-service teachers should have exposure to and training in these methodologies.

**Mentorship Programs:** Establish mentorship programs where experienced Blended Learning educators mentor pre-service teachers, guiding them in the effective use of technology and innovative teaching practices.

**6.3 Maintaining Student Engagement and Motivation****6.3.1 Strategies for Keeping Students Engaged**

**Challenge:** Maintaining student engagement in Blended Learning environments, where students may have varying levels of self-discipline, can be challenging.

**Strategies:**

**Interactive Content:** Develop interactive and engaging digital content, such as simulations, virtual labs, and gamified activities, to capture students' interest and make learning enjoyable.

**Varied Assessment Methods:** Implement diverse assessment methods, including project-based assessments, peer evaluations, and collaborative assignments. Providing students with a range of assessment experiences can keep them motivated.

**6.3.2 Addressing Challenges of Online Learning Fatigue**

**Challenge:** Prolonged engagement with digital learning can lead to online learning fatigue, negatively impacting students' motivation and well-being.

**Strategies:**

**Scheduled Breaks:** Design courses with scheduled breaks and time for students to step away from screens. Encourage physical activity and relaxation during these breaks.

**Mental Health Support:** Provide access to mental health resources and support services for students who may experience online learning fatigue or related stressors.

In conclusion, while Blended Learning in STEM education offers numerous advantages for interdisciplinary learning, it also presents specific challenges related to technology access, educator training, and student engagement. Addressing these challenges with thoughtful strategies is crucial to the successful implementation of Blended Learning in STEM, ensuring that it truly enhances interdisciplinary learning outcomes.

**7. Promoting Inclusivity and Equity**

Ensuring that Blended Learning in STEM education is accessible and equitable is a fundamental concern. In this section, we explore strategies for promoting inclusivity and equity in Blended Learning environments.

**7.1 Strategies for Ensuring Accessibility****7.1.1 Universal Design for Learning (UDL)**

**Ensuring Accessibility:** Universal Design for Learning (UDL) is an approach that aims to make learning accessible to all students, regardless of their abilities or disabilities. It involves designing courses and content that can be accessed, understood, and used to the greatest extent possible by all students, including those with disabilities.

**Implementation:**

**Multiple Means of Representation:** Provide content in multiple formats, such as text, audio, and video, to accommodate diverse learning styles and preferences. Use captions, transcripts, and alt text for images to support

students with hearing or visual impairments.

**Multiple Means of Engagement:** Offer diverse methods for engaging with the material. This might include interactive simulations, hands-on experiments, or collaborative projects. Provide options for students to choose activities that align with their interests and strengths.

**Multiple Means of Expression:** Allow students to demonstrate their understanding and knowledge in various ways. This could involve written assignments, oral presentations, concept maps, or multimedia projects. Flexibility in assessment methods ensures that students can showcase their abilities effectively.

#### 7.1.2 Accessibility Standards and Compliance

**Ensuring Accessibility:** Educational institutions should adhere to accessibility standards and compliance guidelines to guarantee that their Blended Learning content and platforms are accessible to all students.

**Implementation:**

**Compliance Checks:** Regularly audit digital content and learning management systems (LMS) for accessibility compliance. Ensure that materials are compatible with screen readers, keyboard navigation, and other assistive technologies.

**Accessibility Training:** Offer training to educators and instructional designers on creating accessible content and using accessible tools. This knowledge should be an integral part of professional development.

**Accessibility Statements:** Provide clear accessibility statements for online courses, outlining available accommodations and contact information for accessibility support. This information should be readily accessible to all students.

#### 7.1.3 Student Support Services

**Ensuring Accessibility:** Establish comprehensive student support services to assist learners with disabilities and diverse needs in their Blended Learning journey.

**Implementation:**

**Accessibility Office:** Create an accessibility office or department within the institution dedicated to assisting students with disabilities. This office should provide resources, support, and accommodations.

**Individualized Support Plans:** Develop individualized support plans for students with disabilities. These plans should outline the accommodations, assistive technologies, and services required to ensure equitable access to education.

**Accessible Testing Centers:** Set up accessible testing centers equipped with assistive technologies and staffed with experts in accessibility. These centers can facilitate proctored exams and assist students in need.

### 7.2 Overcoming Socioeconomic Disparities

#### 7.2.1 Providing Devices and Internet Connectivity

**Addressing Disparities:** Socioeconomic disparities can prevent some students from accessing Blended Learning resources. To mitigate this, institutions must ensure that students have access to the necessary devices and internet connectivity.

**Implementation:**

**Device Loans:** Establish device loan programs where students can borrow laptops, tablets, or other necessary hardware for the duration of their courses. These programs can be particularly beneficial to economically disadvantaged students.

**Internet Subsidies:** Partner with internet service providers to offer subsidized or discounted internet access to students who require it for online learning. This ensures that all students have reliable internet connections.

**Digital Literacy Training:** Alongside device distribution, provide training on digital literacy to ensure that students can effectively use online resources and platforms.

#### 7.2.2 Affordability of Digital Materials

**Addressing Disparities:** The cost of digital materials, such as e-textbooks and online course subscriptions, can be a barrier for financially struggling students.

**Implementation:**

**Open Educational Resources (OER):** Encourage the adoption of open educational resources, which are freely accessible digital materials. These can replace or supplement traditional textbooks, significantly reducing costs for students.

**Institutional Licensing:** Negotiate institutional licenses for digital materials whenever possible. These licenses can reduce costs for students and grant them access to required resources.

**Textbook Affordability Initiatives:** Implement initiatives aimed at reducing the cost of textbooks. These might include textbook rental programs, partnerships with publishers, or the creation of custom course materials.

### 7.2.3 Scholarships and Financial Assistance

**Addressing Disparities:** Scholarships and financial assistance programs can help economically disadvantaged students afford the costs associated with Blended Learning in STEM education.

**Implementation:**

**Need-Based Scholarships:** Offer need-based scholarships and grants to students who face financial barriers to accessing Blended Learning resources. These scholarships can cover tuition, fees, and course materials.

**Technology Grants:** Provide grants to students to purchase necessary technology devices, such as laptops or tablets, to engage in Blended Learning.

**Emergency Funds:** Establish emergency funds for students who encounter unexpected financial difficulties during their studies. These funds can help them overcome temporary setbacks and continue their education.

In conclusion, promoting inclusivity and equity in Blended Learning in STEM education is essential to ensure that all students have equal opportunities for success. Strategies like Universal Design for Learning, adherence to accessibility standards, comprehensive student support services, and initiatives to overcome socioeconomic disparities can help create an inclusive and equitable educational environment. These efforts empower students from diverse backgrounds to engage effectively in interdisciplinary learning, fostering a richer educational experience for all.

## 8. Future Directions and Research Opportunities

The landscape of education is continually evolving, and exploring the future directions and research opportunities in Blended Learning within STEM education is crucial for its advancement. In this section, we delve into emerging technologies, interdisciplinary research, and global perspectives that hold promise for the future of Blended Learning in STEM.

### 8.1 *Emerging Technologies in Blended STEM Education*

#### 8.1.1 Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning

Artificial Intelligence (AI) and Machine Learning (ML) are poised to play a transformative role in Blended STEM Education:

**Personalized Learning Paths:** AI can analyze students' learning behaviors and tailor content and assessments to individual needs. It can identify areas where students struggle and offer targeted support, enhancing their understanding of STEM concepts.

**Adaptive Assessment:** Machine Learning algorithms can develop adaptive assessment models that continually adjust the difficulty of questions based on a student's performance. This ensures that students are consistently challenged at an appropriate level.

**Predictive Analytics:** AI can predict when a student might struggle with upcoming topics based on their previous performance. Educators can use this information to provide timely interventions.

#### 8.1.2 Augmented and Virtual Reality

Augmented Reality (AR) and Virtual Reality (VR) technologies offer immersive experiences that can revolutionize STEM education:

**Virtual Laboratories:** VR allows students to perform experiments in virtual labs, which can be especially valuable when physical labs are inaccessible. It provides a safe environment for exploration.

**Field Trips and Simulations:** AR and VR can transport students to distant or historically significant locations, offering firsthand experiences that enrich STEM learning. Simulations can replicate real-world scenarios for problem-solving.

**Interactive 3D Models:** These technologies enable the creation of interactive 3D models of complex STEM concepts, making it easier for students to grasp abstract ideas.

#### 8.1.3 Blockchain and Credentialing

Blockchain technology has the potential to revolutionize credentialing and accreditation in STEM education:

**Tamper-Proof Credentials:** Blockchain can securely store student credentials and achievements. Employers and institutions can verify the authenticity of qualifications without relying on centralized institutions.

**Micro-Credentials:** Blockchain can support the issuance of micro-credentials, allowing students to showcase specific skills and competencies gained through Blended Learning courses.

**Lifetime Learning Records:** A blockchain-based system can create a lifelong learning record for individuals, tracking their educational achievements, skills, and professional development throughout their careers.

## 8.2 *Interdisciplinary Research in STEM Education*

### 8.2.1 Collaboration among STEM Disciplines

STEM disciplines are inherently interconnected, and fostering collaboration among them can enrich Blended Learning:

**Interdisciplinary Courses:** Develop Blended Learning courses that integrate content from multiple STEM disciplines. This approach encourages students to see the connections between different fields.

**Interdisciplinary Research:** Promote collaborative research projects that involve faculty and students from various STEM backgrounds. These projects can address complex, real-world problems.

**Integrated Pedagogical Approaches:** Explore teaching methods that leverage the strengths of multiple STEM disciplines. For example, incorporating physics concepts into biology courses for a deeper understanding of biomechanics.

### 8.2.2 Cross-Institutional Research Partnerships

Cross-institutional research partnerships have the potential to advance the knowledge base of Blended Learning in STEM:

**Data Sharing:** Institutions can collaborate to share data on the effectiveness of Blended Learning approaches. This data can inform best practices and help identify areas for improvement.

**Large-Scale Studies:** Partnerships between multiple institutions can facilitate large-scale research studies that involve diverse student populations. This can lead to more robust findings.

**Pooling Resources:** Collaborative efforts can allow institutions to pool resources, such as funding for research projects and access to advanced technologies.

### 8.2.3 Advancing the Knowledge Base on Blended Learning in STEM

The field of Blended Learning in STEM education continues to evolve, offering several research opportunities:

**Longitudinal Studies:** Conduct longitudinal studies to track the long-term impact of Blended Learning on students' academic and career outcomes.

**Comparative Research:** Compare the effectiveness of different Blended Learning models and approaches to identify which strategies yield the best results for various STEM disciplines.

**Faculty Development:** Investigate the impact of faculty development programs on the successful integration of Blended Learning in STEM courses.

## 8.3 *Global Perspectives on Blended STEM Education*

### 8.3.1 International Case Studies and Best Practices

International case studies provide valuable insights into successful Blended Learning initiatives around the world:

**Cross-Cultural Adaptation:** Examine how Blended Learning approaches are adapted to suit diverse cultural contexts and educational systems.

**Best Practices Exchange:** Facilitate the exchange of best practices between institutions in different countries. This can lead to the refinement of Blended Learning strategies.

### 8.3.2 Cross-Cultural Considerations in Blended Learning

Considerations for cross-cultural Blended Learning:

**Language Accessibility:** Ensure that Blended Learning materials are accessible to non-native English speakers. Offer translations and support for students from diverse linguistic backgrounds.

**Cultural Sensitivity:** Develop content and assessments that are culturally sensitive and do not inadvertently disadvantage students from specific cultural backgrounds.

**Global Collaboration:** Encourage students to collaborate with peers from different countries, fostering cross-cultural understanding and collaboration skills.

In conclusion, the future of Blended Learning in STEM education holds exciting possibilities, driven by emerging technologies, interdisciplinary research, and global perspectives. These opportunities have the

potential to transform STEM education, making it more accessible, engaging, and effective for learners worldwide. By embracing these future directions and research opportunities, educators and institutions can continue to enhance the quality of STEM education through Blended Learning.

## 9. Conclusion

In the final section of this comprehensive exploration of Blended Learning in STEM education, we bring together the key findings and insights discussed throughout this paper. We reaffirm the value of Blended Learning in STEM education and issue a call to action for educators, institutions, and researchers to embrace innovative approaches to foster interdisciplinary learning in STEM.

### 9.1 Summary of Key Findings and Insights

#### 9.1.1 The Power of Blended Learning

Blended Learning, as a pedagogical approach that combines online and in-person elements, offers significant advantages in STEM education:

**Flexibility:** Blended Learning accommodates diverse learning styles and preferences. Students can engage with content at their own pace and revisit materials as needed.

**Access to Resources:** It provides access to a wealth of digital resources, including multimedia content, simulations, and online collaboration tools that enhance the learning experience.

**Personalization:** Blended Learning allows for personalized learning paths, catering to individual student needs and abilities.

**Enhanced Engagement:** The integration of technology and interactive elements keeps students engaged and motivated.

#### 9.1.2 Interdisciplinary Learning

STEM education benefits immensely from interdisciplinary learning:

**Real-World Relevance:** Interdisciplinary approaches mirror real-world challenges, preparing students for complex problem-solving in their careers.

**Holistic Understanding:** Blended Learning can seamlessly integrate content from multiple STEM disciplines, providing students with a holistic understanding of STEM concepts.

**Transferable Skills:** Interdisciplinary learning fosters critical thinking, creativity, and collaboration skills that extend beyond the classroom.

#### 9.1.3 Technology Integration

Effective technology integration is essential for the success of Blended Learning in STEM:

**Virtual Laboratories and Simulations:** These tools offer practical experience in a controlled environment, addressing the challenges of physical labs.

**Collaborative Online Platforms:** They facilitate student collaboration, enabling them to work together on STEM projects, even in virtual settings.

**Personalized Learning and Assessment:** Technology allows for adaptive learning paths and continuous assessment, which enhance student engagement and achievement.

### 9.2 Affirmation of the Value of Blended Learning in STEM Education

This exploration underscores the immense value that Blended Learning brings to STEM education. It aligns with the evolving needs of students in the digital age, where technology is a central part of their lives. Blended Learning not only harnesses the power of technology but also enhances the educational experience by promoting flexibility, personalization, and engagement.

The integration of Blended Learning with STEM education fosters interdisciplinary learning, preparing students to tackle real-world problems that transcend disciplinary boundaries. It equips them with the skills and mindset necessary for success in the 21st-century workforce.

### 9.3 Call to Action for Educators, Institutions, and Researchers

As we conclude this exploration, we issue a call to action for educators, institutions, and researchers in STEM education:

#### 9.3.1 Educators

**Embrace Blended Learning:** Educators should embrace Blended Learning as a powerful pedagogical approach that enhances the quality of STEM education. They should explore innovative technologies and teaching

methods to engage and empower students.

**Promote Interdisciplinary Learning:** Encourage interdisciplinary learning by integrating content from different STEM disciplines. Show students how concepts are interconnected and apply to real-world situations.

**Continuous Professional Development:** Engage in continuous professional development to stay updated with emerging technologies and teaching strategies that enhance Blended Learning.

### 9.3.2 Institutions

**Invest in Technology:** Institutions should invest in technology infrastructure and resources to support Blended Learning effectively. Ensure that all students have access to the necessary devices and internet connectivity.

**Faculty Training Programs:** Develop comprehensive faculty training programs that equip educators with the skills and knowledge to implement Blended Learning effectively.

**Interdisciplinary Curriculum Development:** Support the development of interdisciplinary STEM curriculum that integrates Blended Learning seamlessly.

### 9.3.3 Researchers

**Advance the Knowledge Base:** Researchers should continue to advance the knowledge base on Blended Learning in STEM education through rigorous research and evaluation. Conduct longitudinal studies to assess the long-term impact on student learning outcomes.

**Collaboration and Knowledge Sharing:** Foster collaboration among researchers, institutions, and educators to share best practices and insights. Collaborate on cross-disciplinary and cross-institutional research projects.

**Global Perspectives:** Explore global perspectives on Blended Learning in STEM by examining international case studies and cross-cultural considerations. This can inform best practices and strategies for diverse student populations.

In conclusion, Blended Learning offers a transformative approach to STEM education, aligning with the needs and expectations of today's learners. It is a dynamic and adaptable pedagogical strategy that empowers educators to engage students, foster interdisciplinary learning, and prepare them for the challenges and opportunities of the future. By embracing innovative approaches to Blended Learning, educators, institutions, and researchers can collectively contribute to the evolution and enhancement of STEM education.

## References

- Bybee, R. W. (2010). Advancing STEM Education: A 2020 Vision. *Technology and Engineering Teacher*, 70, 30-35.
- Dede, C. (2010). Comparing frameworks for 21st century skills. In J. Bellance, & R. Brandt (Eds.), *21st century skills: Rethinking how students learn* (pp. 51-76). Bloomington, IN: Solution Tree Press.
- Ertmer, P. A., & Newby, T. J. (1993). Behaviorism, cognitivism, constructivism: Comparing critical features from an instructional design perspective. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, 6(4), 50-72. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1937-8327.1993.tb00605.x>.
- Garrison, D. R., & Kanuka, H. (2004). Blended learning: Uncovering its transformative potential in higher education. *The Internet and Higher Education*, 7(2), 95-105.
- Johnson, L., Adams, S., Cummins, M., Estrada, V., Freeman, A. & Ludgate, H. (2013). *NMC Horizon Report: 2013 Higher Education Edition*. Austin, Texas: The New Media Consortium. Retrieved September 5, 2023 from <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/46484/>.
- Jonassen, D. H. (1991). Objectivism versus constructivism: Do we need a new philosophical paradigm? *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 39(3), 5-14. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02296434>.
- Lee, J., & Lee, W. (2010). The analysis of the e-learning effect on college students' critical thinking. *Educational Technology & Society*, 13(1), 214-224.
- Means, Barbara & Toyama, Yukie & Murphy, Robert & Bakia, Marianne & Jones, Karla & Planning, Evaluation. (2010). Evaluation of Evidence-Based Practices in Online Learning: A Meta-Analysis and Review of Online Learning Studies. [http://lst-iiiep.iiep-unesco.org/cgi-bin/wwwi32.exe/\[in=epidoc1.in\]/?t2000=027003/\(100\)](http://lst-iiiep.iiep-unesco.org/cgi-bin/wwwi32.exe/[in=epidoc1.in]/?t2000=027003/(100)). 115.
- Min, W., & Yu, Z. (2023). A Systematic Review of Critical Success Factors in Blended Learning. *Education Sciences*, 13(5), 469. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci13050469>.
- Moore, M. G. (1993). Theory of Transactional Distance. In D. Keegan (Ed.), *Theoretical Principles of Distance Education* (pp. 22-29). New York: Routledge.



- Prince, M. (2004). Does Active Learning Work? A Review of the Research. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 93, 223-231. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/j.2168-9830.2004.tb00809.x>.
- Siemens, G. (2005). Connectivism: A learning theory for the digital age, *International Journal of Instructional Technology and Distance Learning*, 2. [http://www.itdl.org/Journal/Jan\\_05/article01.htm](http://www.itdl.org/Journal/Jan_05/article01.htm).
- Staker, H., & Horn, M. B. (2012). Classifying K-12 Blended Learning. Mountain View, CA: Innosight Institute. <http://www.christenseninstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Classifying-K-12-blended-learning.pdf>.

### Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).